Public Officials and the Right to Silence

Yael Wiesel | Mordechai Kremnitzer | Edna Harel-Fisher | Ory Has Rahav

April 2021

Abstract



PUBLIC OFFICIALS AND THE RIGHT TO SILENCE



Yael Wiesel | Mordechai Kremnitzer | Edna Harel-Fisher | Ory Has Rahav

> Motion for the Agenda 36 April 2021

Text Editor [Hebrew]: Dafna Lavi

Series and Cover Design: Studio Tamar Bar Dayan

Typesetting: Nadav Shtechman Polischuk

No portion of this book may be reproduced, copied, photographed, recorded, translated, stored in a database, broadcast, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, optical, mechanical, or otherwise. Commercial use in any form of the material contained in this book without the express written permission of the publisher is strictly forbidden.

Copyright © 2021 by the Israel Democracy Institute (RA)

Printed in Israel

The Israel Democracy Institute

4 Pinsker St., P.O.B. 4702, Jerusalem 9104602

Tel: (972)-2-5300-888

Website: en.idi.org.il

To order books:

Online Book Store: en.idi.org.il/publications

E-mail: orders@idi.org.il

Tel: (972)-2-5300-800

The views expressed in this policy paper do not necessarily reflect those of the Israel Democracy Institute.

All IDI publications may be downloaded for free, in full or in part, from our website.

ABSTRACT

The issue of public representatives and public employees who, under criminal investigation regarding their public office and conduct, choose to invoke their right to silence, trains a spotlight on the inherent tension between their individual rights and their public accountability. As public servants, these officials are accountable to the public for activities conducted in their official capacity, and to act transparently. As individual suspects, however, they are legally entitled to remain silent under police interrogation and to refrain from answering any questions that might incriminate them. In several cases in recent years, high-ranking Israeli officials have invoked their right to silence during investigation, drawing harsh public criticism. But in the eyes of the law, the fact that they hold public office is irrelevant. In the absence of legal obligations, it would appear that public and ethical norms in Israel are too weak to be sufficiently effective.

In the absence of strong public norms, we propose advancing a legislative solution that would require public officials to choose between remaining in office and exercising their right to silence. According to this proposal, high-ranking public officials and public representatives who opt to remain silent under investigation will be removed from office, subject to review by

i٧

the Attorney General or a public committee in response to an application from the official under suspicion. Low- and medium-level public officials who choose to invoke their right to silence will be subject to sanctions up to and including removal from office, to be applied at the discretion of the Civil Service Commissioner.

Adv. Yael Wiesel was a research assistant at the Israel Democracy Institute. She holds a bachelor's degree in law and humanities from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem's Amirim honors program, and completed her legal internship in the chambers of Supreme Court Justice Isaac Amit.

Prof. Mordechai Kremnitzer is a professor emeritus of law at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and a senior fellow at the Israel Democracy Institute.

Adv. Edna Harel-Fisher is a research fellow at the Israel Democracy Institute. She has held various senior positions in Israel's civil service, mostly in the field of legal advice to the government. At the Israel Democracy Institute, she focuses on cultural policy and on the integrity and non-partisanship of Israel's civil service, and serves as head of the Program on Combatting Government Corruption.

Ory Has Rahav was a research assistant at the Israel Democracy Institute. He holds a bachelor's degree in law and philosophy from the Hebrew University of Jerusalem, and is a legal intern at the Ministry of Justice's counseling and legislation department.

